134-12/MFM FREEHILL HOGAN & MAHAR, LLP Attorneys for Petitioners/Plaintiffs McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., INC. and McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC 80 Pine Street New York, New York 10005 (212) 425-1900 Mark F. Muller, Esq. John J. Walsh, Esq.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

----X In the Matter of the

IN ADMIRALTY

Complaint of Plaintiffs, McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., INC. as Owner and McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC, as Owner Pro Hac Vice of the Tug

PATRICE McALLISTER for Exoneration

from/or Limitation of Liability

PETITIONERS/PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO CLAIM OF IRONHEAD MARINE, INC.

12 Civil 2505 (LAK)

McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO., Inc. as Owner and McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC, as Owner Pro Hac Vice of the Tug PATRICE McALLISTER (hereinafter referred to as "McALLISTER") by their attorneys, Freehill, Hogan & Mahar LLP, responds to Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim Against Petitioners dated July 2, 2012 (commencing at page 4 of its Answer and Claim dated July 2, 2012) upon information and belief as follows:

FIRST: McALLISTER admits the allegations contained in paragraphs numbered "1," "2," "3," "6," "11," "12," "13," "14," "15," "16," "21" and "22" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim against Petitioners.

SECOND: McALLISTER denies any knowledge or information to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs numbered "4," "5," "7," "8," "9," "17," "18" and "19" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim against Petitioners.

THIRD: Answering paragraph numbered "10" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim Against Petitioners, McALLISTER admits that the PATRICE McALLISTER was and still is a vessel with Official Number 1082214, and a Coast Guard Documented "gross tonnage of 149 tons." McALLISTER denies any knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to each and every other allegation contained in paragraph numbered "10" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim Against Petitioners.

FOURTH: Answering paragraph numbered "20" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim Against Petitioners, McALLISTER admits that Eduardo Escobedo, Fleet Engineer McAllister Towing, was present at Ironhead Marine's shipyard and aboard the tug during portions of the tug's overhaul period. McALLISTER denies any knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to each and every other allegation contained in paragraph numbered "20" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim Against Petitioners.

FIFTH: Answering paragraph numbered "23" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim Against Petitioners, McALLISTER admits that present available information indicates that a cause or contributing cause of the fire was a cracked threaded pipe connected to the pre-lube oil pump on the tug's port engine. Denies each and every other allegation contained in paragraph numbered "23."

SIXTH: McALLISTER denies each and every allegation contained in paragraphs numbered "24," "25," "26" and "27" of Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim and Answer.

### AS AND FOR A FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

SEVENTH: In the event that this Honorable Court lacks jurisdiction over Ohio Machinery Company d/b/a Ohio Cat then this action should be transferred to Ohio federal court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1404(a).

## AS AND FOR A SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

EIGHTH: The incident onboard the tug PATRICE McALLISTER, including any loss, damages and/or injuries to persons onboard the tug, were not the result of any negligence, fault or want of due care on the part of McALLISTER.

WHEREFORE, McALLISTER demands that Ironhead Marine, Inc.'s Claim and Answer dated July 2, 2012 be dismissed with costs and attorneys' fees to McALLISTER as against Ironhead Marine, Inc. and that the Court grant to McALLISTER such other, further and different relief as the justice of the cause may require.

Dated: October 11, 2012

FREEHILL HOGAN & MAHAR, LLP

Attorneys for Petitioners/Plaintiffs

McALLISTER TOWING & TRANSPORTATION CO. INC.

and McALLISTER TOWING OF NEW YORK, LLC

By:

Mark F. Muller John J. Walsh 80 Pine Street

New York, New York 10005 Telephone: (212) 425-1900 Facsimile: (212) 425-1901

muller@freehill.com walsh@freehill.com

### TO: RUBIN, FIORELLA & FRIEDMAN, LLP

Attorneys for Claimant IRONHEAD MARINE, INC. 630 Third Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor New York, New York 10017

Tel: 212-953-2381

Attn: James E. Mercante, Esq. Attn: Richard Gonzalez, Esq. *jmercante@rubinfiorella.com* rgonzalez@rubinfiorella.com

# TABAK, MELLUSI & SHISHA, LLP

Attorneys for Claimant JOHN A. HOBAN, as Administrator and Personal Representative of the Estate of Matthew A. Hoban 29 Broadway, Suite 2311

New York, New York 10006-3212

Attn: Jacob Shisha, Esq. Attn: Ralph J. Mellusi, Esq. *jshisha@sealawyers.com* 

# LATTI & ANDERSON, LLP

Attorneys for Claimant
JOHN A. HOBAN, as Administrator and Personal
Representative of the Estate of Matthew A. Hoban
30-31 Union Wharf
Boston, MA 02109
Clatti@lattianderson.com
Carolyn M. Latti, Esq.

SEDGWICK, LLP
Attorneys for Claimant/Defendant
CATERPILLAR INC.
Three Gateway Center, Twelfth Floor
Newark, NJ 07102-4072
Attn: Shaun A. Bean, Esq.
Tel: 973-242-0002
shaun.bean@sedgwicklaw.com

LYONS & FLOOD, LLP Attorneys for Claimant Ohio Machinery Company d/b/a Ohio Cat 65 West 36<sup>th</sup> Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, New York 10018 Attn: Edward P. Flood, Esq. eflood@lyons-flood.com

Seth S. Holbrook, Esq. Attorneys for Claimant Ohio Machinery Company d/b/a Ohio Cat 238-240 Lewis Wharf Boston, MA 02110 Holbrook\_murphy@msn.com